

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE

1. Grievance committee meeting held on 11-05-2024 at 12:00 pm in continuation of grievance committee held on 03-04-2024 at 11:30 am under the chairmanship of Prof. Dr. Farah Shafi (Prof. of Medicine AMC/PGMI/LGH, Lahore to resolve the grievances submitted by the firms, for the hiring of Security Services, Lahore General Hospital, Lahore.
2. Following committee members attended the meeting:
 - Prof. Dr. Muhammad Faheem Afzal, Prof. of Pediatrics, PGMI/AMC/LGH, Lahore.
 - Prof. Dr. Khizer Hayat Gondal, (Prof of Urology), AMC/PGMI/LHG, Lahore.
 - Dr. Ghias-ul- Hassan, Assistant Prof. of Gastroenterology, PGMI/AMC/LGH, Lahore.
 - Engr. Muhammad Ali, Biomedical Engineer / Technical Officer, PGMI/AMC, Lahore.
3. Firms Representative also attended the meeting.
4. The items were discussed in detail as follows:

Sr. No.	Name of Tender	Name of Firm	Grievance of the Firm	Grievance Committee	Legal Opinion	Decision
1	Hiring of Security Services	M/S Belfort Security	<p>It is submitted that Belfort Security participated in the bidding process for provision of security services at Lahore General Hospital as per tender uploaded on PPRAs Punjab as per the requirement technical and financial proposals were submitted with Lahore General Hospital Lahore. After the evaluation, minutes of technical committee meeting was uploaded on website of Health department regarding hiring of security services on 18-0-2024. As per the decision of committee, Belfort has been declared qualified for tender.</p>	<p>Grievance Committee members reviewed the Grievance of the aggrieved firm and decided that the case may be sent to the legal advisor for legal advice on two discrepancies.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • According to technical numbering criteria Para # 4 Human Resource Management, Instead of Individual certified training certificate of security guard by APSA / Government Body Certification (Max. Number 05), M/S Belfort Security attached a government approved body (FSS) Certificates. • According to technical 	<p>Grievance Committee members rechecked / reviewed the technical bid of the aggrieved firm and all other firms. Grievance committee listened the stance of the aggrieved firm and decided to take legal opinion from LGH Legal Advisor. IN this regard a letter issued to MR. Zain Qureshi Legal Advisor LGH with letter no. 22132 /LGH dated 05-04-2024. In response of this letter a reply with ref. no. LO/LGH-MAO/21-2014 dated 24-04-2024 received through what's app on 08-05-2024 from the Mr. Zain Qureshi legal advisor of LGH (Annexed). This opinion with reference to the proposition put forth in which our firm is asked to advise the LGH with regards to grievance submitted by M/S Belfort Security Services regarding the tender notice of hiring of security services published by your kind office i.e. Medical Superintendent LGH.</p> <p>In regards to the issue No. 1, it is advised that since Fauji Security Services (FSS) is a private limited company and not a Government</p>	<p>Grievance of M/S Belfort Security Rejected and M/S Firewall Security declared Technically Non Responsive.</p>

	<p>➤ However in the Technical Comparative Statement / Knockout criteria we have been awarded 88 Marks. The declaration of marks as per Serial 3 (Past Performance) and serial 4 (Human Resource Management) are not justified as per provided complete documents as per the requirement. Previous Statement on the subject can also be studied / compared to find out the difference / facts.</p> <p>➤ In view of above you are requested to revisit our documents for the justification of deduction of 12 marks and intimate the outcome for our further necessary action. We assure you that Belfort Security Services Pvt. Ltd. Will always strive to provide high quality services and maintain this tender with a resolve to achieve complete customer satisfaction through excellence of services.</p>	<p>numbering criteria Para # 3 of Past Performance, Satisfactory past performance certificate from head of organization (Max. No. 10), only Four Valid certificates were attached. However, the fifth certificate issued by the Sr. Manager Administration of Four Brothers which is not considered as head of the organization by the LGH Technical Evaluation Committee.</p>	<p>➤ Agency, therefore the individual Certified Training Certificate issued by FSS may not be considered valid being against the criteria of the said tender.</p> <p>➤ In regards to the issue No. 2 it has been consistently held by the Honorable Courts that Head of an Organization is someone who is equipped with absolute powers to have control over members of the organization, therefore, it is advised that a senior Manager cannot be equated with the Head of an Organization being not authorized to exercise absolute power over all members of an organization. Thus, the Certificate issued by the Senior Manager of Four Brothers is not liable to be considered as valid as per the criteria laid down by the Technical Evaluation Report.</p> <p>➤ Hence decision of the technical committee stand upheld and grievance committee unanimously decided that the grievance of the firm not accepted. Secondly upon rechecking of the technical bids Technical Officer pointed out that the attached license of Walkie Talkie form PTA / relevant authority / agency of the firm M/S Firewall Security expired / not valid. Therefore M/S Firewall Security declared Technically Non Responsive.</p>	
--	---	--	--	--

Prof. Dr. Farah Shafi (Prof. of Medicine), PGMI/AMC/LGH, Lahore.

Prof. Dr. Khizer Hayat Gondal, (Prof of Urology), AMC/PGMI/LHG, Lahore.

Prof. Dr. Muhammad Faheem Afzal, Prof. of Pediatrics, PGMI/AMC/LGH, Lahore.

Dr. Ghias-ul- Hassan, Assistant Prof. of Gastroenterology, PGMI/AMC/LGH, Lahore.

Engr. Muhammad Ali, Biomedical Engineer / Technical Officer, PGMI/AMC, Lahore.