



**OFFICE OF THE MEDICAL SUPERINTENDENT
LAHORE GENERAL HOSPITAL, LAHORE.**

No. 15805 PH.No.042-99268801-06
To, /LGH dated Lahore the 07-03- 2024.

The Secretary Health,
Government of the Punjab Specialized,
Health Care & Medical Education Department,
Lahore.

Attention:

(ICT) PPRA Website,
SHC & ME Department,
Govt. of the Punjab, Lahore.

Subject: **GRIEVANCE REPORT:**

With reference to the subject cited above.

It is therefore kindly requested to issue instruction to the Focal Person PPRA Website to upload the Grievance for the annual service & maintenance contract of following biomedical equipment's/items installed in different department of this hospital.

S.#.	Name of Biomedical Equipment's
1.	Annual Services & Maintenance Contract of ICU Ventilators with Parts, Accessories/Consumable Items, Event Qty.05 & Lowenstein Qty.04 (Total Qty.9). Installed in different Department.
4.	Annual Services & Maintenance Contract of Central Gas Supply System with Parts, Accessories/ Consumable items Installed in Medicine Department (Complete System).

It is therefore kindly requested to issue the instruction to the focal person to upload the same on the official website of PPRA.

Mudrat Shail
Medical Superintendent,
Lahore General Hospital,
Lahore. *[Signature]* 2024.

No. _____/LGH dated Lahore the _____

A copy is forwarded for information to the:-

1. Principal PGMI/AMC/Lahore General Hospital, Lahore.
2. Prof. Dr. Farah Shafi Prof. of Medical Unit-I, Chairman Grievance Committee LGH, LHR.
3. Prof. Dr. Muhammad Shahid Prof. of Peds Unit-I LGH, LHR.
4. Prof. Dr. Muhammad Faheem Afzal Prof. of Peds Unit-II, LGH, LHR.
5. AMS (R & M) LGH, LHR.
6. DMS (R & M) LGH, LHR.
7. Biomedical Engineers LGH, LHR.
8. Mr. Rashid Mansoor, Computer Programmer (With direction to the upload on official website) of Lahore General Hospital, Lahore.
9. S.S.K.LGH, Lahore.

Medical Superintendent,
Lahore General Hospital,
Lahore.

Minutes of Grievance Committee

1. Grievance Committee meeting was held on 03-02-2024 under the Chairmanship of Prof Dr. Farah Shafi Prof. of Medicine to resolve the grievance submitted by the firms for the Annual Service & Maintenance Contract of Different Biomedical Equipment's.
2. Following Committee members attended the meeting: -
 - I. Prof. Dr. Faheem Afzal, Prof. of Pediatrics Medicine.
 - II. Dr. Ghias-ul-Hassan, Assistant Prof. of Gastroenterology.
 - III. Dr. Aun Jamal, Assistant prof. of Surgery.
 - IV. Engr. Muhammad Ali Biomedical Engineer.
3. The following items were discussed: -

Sr. No.	Tender Sr. No.	Name of Tender	Name of Firm	Grievance of Firm	Remarks of Grievance Committee	Decision of Committee
01	01	Annual Services & Maintenance Contract of ICU Ventilators with Parts, Accessories / Consumable Items Nanjing Superstar Qty.16, Event Medical Qty.05 & Lowenstein Medical Qty.04 (Total Qty.25). Installed in different Department.	M/S Eastern Medical Technology Services	<p>Grievance Against M/S Perfect Enterprises</p> <p>We have gone through results of financing bid opening under above reference and have very serious business and technical concerns for considering offer of M/S Perfect Enterprises, Lahore for very sensitive equipment of ICU Ventilators—under the facts that they have no technical capability to make working any ICU Ventilators—whereas, we are the only exclusive distributor of Event Medical, USA-by maintaining very an experience/trained technical staff who are already rendering their services to our valued customers throughout Pakistan's installations of more than 500 units-not only functional in teaching hospitals but also in DHQ/THQ/Armed Forces hospitals.</p> <p>Needless to mention here further that we have enjoyed completing two contracts in PINS of your hospital while another one contract still in swing.</p> <p>Thus, we strongly submit our representation to kind re-consider your decision by avoiding to make contract with a company which don't have required expertise to full fill contractual and making units working obligations in all respect, especially while we are exclusive distributor of such supplied ICU Vents,</p> <p>Thanking You.</p>	<p>The committee members listened to aggrieved firm in detail and gone through the grievance of the said firm, as per clause no. 3.1 of the bidding documents it is clearly mentioned that this invitation for bids is open to all well reputed firms & authorized agents of foreign manufacturers in Pakistan for Services & maintenance contract.</p> <p>Grievance committee upheld the decision of the technical committee.</p>	Grievance Rejected

Ch. Iqbal

For Dr. Aun Jamal

Dr. Rabia Saeed
 MBBS, MRCGS, FRCGS
 Senior Registrar Unit IV
 Lahore General Hospital, Lahore

6/5

Tender Sr. No.	Name of Tender	Name of Firm	Grievance of Firm	Remarks of Grievance Committee	Decision of Committee
02	01	Annual Services & Maintenance Contract of ICU Ventilators with Parts, Accessories / Consumable Items Nanjing Superstar Qty.16, Event Medical Qty.05 & Lowenstein Medical Qty.04 (Total Qty.25). Installed in different Department.	M/S Total Technologies (Pvt.) Ltd. Grievance Against M/S Perfect Enterprises This is in reference to the technical evaluation report drafted on above referred tender inquiry no. against which we would like to submit our reservations / grievances are under; - Annual Services & Maintenance Contract of ICU Ventilators. The ventilators for which annual services & maintenance contract is required is for the brand of M/S Lowenstein Medical—Germany having Model; Elisa 600. Therefore, compatible spare parts support from same manufacturer would only be required for the said ventilators. We are the sole distributor of M/S Lowenstein Medical's ICU Ventilators in Pakistan for the sales & after sales services support. In the above technical evaluation report, a firm "M/S Perfect Enterprises" has been declared as "responsive whereas the firm M/S Perfect Enterprises would not be able to avail the requisite compatible spares from the manufacturer M/S Lowenstein Medical-Germany as it would cause incompatibility or disproportionate technical Criteria 12,15,16 & 18. Therefore, a third-party attempt on the above said ventilators would create technical complexities meanwhile the firm may not be able to quire compatible parts ICU Ventilators as well. Therefore, the offer of M/S Perfect Enterprises may please be re-evaluated. Please ask us if you need any further information in this regard.	The committee members listened to aggrieved firm in detail and gone through the grievance of the said firm, as per clause no. 3.1 of the bidding documents it is clearly mentioned that this invitation for bids is open to all well reputed firms & authorized agents of foreign manufacturers in Pakistan for Services & maintenance contract. As per recommendation of the Grievance Committee DMS (Repair) & Biomedical Engineer in person visited the workshop of M/S Perfect Enterprises, checked, and found satisfactory about the availability of required spare parts / accessories to run these ventilators smoothly. Grievance committee upheld the decision of the technical committee.	Grievance Rejected
03	04	Annual Services & Maintenance Contract of Central Gas Supply System with Parts, Accessories/ Consumable items Installed in Medicine Department (Complete System).	M/S Vertex Medical (Pvt.) Ltd Grievance Against M/S Perfect Enterprises With reference to the above cited subject, the institute is conducting bidding process for annual service & maintenance contract of central gas supply system with parts, accessories/consumable items installed in Medicine department of Drager Germany. We M/S Vertex Medical (Pvt.) Ltd. are the authorize Sole distributor of Central Gas Management System (GMS) of Drager Germany. We have following reservations on TAC report & want to submit our grievance as per clause 39.3 of standard bidding documents stated as; "Any bidder feeling aggrieved by any act of the procuring agency after the submission of his bid may lodge a written complaint concerning his	Committee members gone through the grievance of the said firm, as per clause no. 3.1 of the bidding documents it is clearly mentioned that this invitation for bids is open to all well reputed firms & authorized agents of foreign manufacturers in Pakistan for Services & maintenance contract. After Listening to M/S Vertex Medical (Pvt.) Ltd. representative, Grievance committee listened M/S Perfect Enterprises representative who	Grievance Rejected

Tender Sr. No.	Name of Tender	Name of Firm	Grievance of Firm	Remarks of Grievance Committee	Decision of Committee
			<p>grievance no later than ten (10 days) after the announcement of the technical bid evaluation report".</p> <p>M/S Perfect Enterprises were strongly favored in the bidding process while totally ignoring the advertised Evaluation Criteria, however they are deficient on the following grounds.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Isn't the authorize distributor of GMS Drager, Germany nor remained in the past. 2. Doesn't have any approved technical staff i.e. at least Two BSC Engineer (PEC Registered Engineer) in the firm. 3. Doesn't have any experience for handling the installed central gas supply system of Drager, Germany. 4. Doesn't have any spare parts, calibration tools for the installed central gas supply system of Drager, Germany. 5. Doesn't have any past Performance / Experience for the installed central gas supply system of Drager, Germany. 6. However, M/S Perfect Enterprises were qualified by the TAC totally while ignoring the facts & figures mentioned above. For running the smooth supply of Medical GMS in the institute, it is humbly prayed that please technically disqualify the M/S Perfect Enterprises above mentioned ground which are part of the Technical Evaluation Criteria. <p>We will ensure our best services in this regard. Thanks, and best wishes.</p>	<p>briefed Grievance Committee that their firm already have a maintenance & service contract of Air Compressors of LGH Emergency (Make: Atlas Copco) award letter no. 22687 Dated 20-03-2023. Also, M/S Perfect Enterprises representative furnished an award letter of same brand Air Compressor (as installed in LGH Medicine Department), they are running in Services Hospital against award letter no. 97025 dated 16-12-2024.</p> <p>M/S Perfect Enterprises representative briefed Grievance Committee that their firm already installed central gas pipeline with bedhead units in LGH Medical Unit 03 ICU (Now Medical 02 ICU).</p> <p>Grievance committee took opinion from the End Users of Medicine and Peads department which were continuous complainants about their (M/S Vertex Medical Pvt. Ltd.) services regarding Central Gas Supply System (Compressed Air) due to which ICU Ventilator services of the Medical 01 ICU remained suspended for more than a year due to which patient suffered in the end.</p> <p>Grievance committee upheld the decision of the technical committee.</p>	

1. Prof. Dr. Farah Shafi, Prof. of Medicine.
2. Prof. Dr. Faheem Afzal, Prof. of Pediatrics Medicine.
3. Dr. Ghias-ul-Hassan, Assistant Prof. of Gastroenterology.
4. Dr. Aun Jamal, Assistant prof. of Surgery.
5. Engr. Muhammad Ali Biomedical Engineer.

Farah

Dr. Ghias-ul-Hassan
Dr. Aun Jamal
Engr. Muhammad Ali